

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES- October 15, 2007

CONCEPT REVIEW - NEW ITEM: PUBLIC HEARING

4. 1057 ARBOLADO RD E-1 Zone
 (5:00) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-241-013
 Application Number: MST2007-00462
 Owner: Ann S. De Bruyn Kops
 Applicant: Mike Gones

(Proposal for additions and alterations to an existing one-story 2,024 square foot single-family residence located on a 13,504 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. Proposed are first-floor additions of 516 square feet, a new 893 square foot second-story, replace all roofing, complete exterior remodel, and repaving the driveway, and 50 cubic yards of fill grading. The project will result in a 3,433 square foot structure which is 82% of the maximum allowable FAR. Staff Hearing officer approval of a modification to encroach into the front yard setback is requested.)

(COMMENTS ONLY; PROJECT REQUIRES ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT AND STAFF HEARING OFFICER APPROVAL OF A MODIFICATION.)

(5:01)

Present: Mike Gones, Applicant; Paul and Ann De Bruyn Kops, Owners.

Public comment opened at 5:14 p.m. The following individuals expressed concern:

1. Derek Westen, Attorney representing neighbors; project is not designed sensitively.
2. Brad Simon, resident: opposed to project height.
3. Gaile Baratto, resident: loss of views.
4. Nick Svensson, resident: loss of views.
5. Jacqueline Page, resident: loss of views.
6. Nancy Kaplan, visitor: loss of views.
7. Doug McElwain, resident: mass, and change of views.
8. Elaine Daugherty, visitor: size impacts.
9. Cliff Hickman, Designer: view impacts.
10. Chris Kamen, resident: loss of backyard privacy.
11. Dory Turk-Kamen: sensitivity for privacy.
12. Joyce Searles, resident: project sets a precedent for the area.
13. Bruce Morrow, resident: loss of views; encouraged a Board site visit.
14. Marge Graves, resident: privacy and views of the neighborhood.
15. Justina Evans, resident: concerned about loss of views.
16. Jeff Evans, resident: proposal does not blend into the neighborhood.
17. Jack Hewitt, resident: view protection needed, per SFDB Guidelines.
18. Diane Hall, resident: loss of views.
19. Steve Buchanan, resident: requested that applicant meet with neighbors.

Public comment closed at 5:44 p.m.

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) Restudy the design to reduce the size, bulk, and scale, particularly the tower and stair area.
- 2) Provide dimensions from the property line to any proposed decks.
- 3) If the applicant retains the two-story concept, the Board will require story poles.

Action: Bernstein/Woolery, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Deisler absent.)

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES - May 12, 2008

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)

6. 1057 ARBOLADO RD E-1 Zone
(6:15) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-241-013
 Application Number: MST2007-00462
 Owner: Ann S. De Bruyn Kops
 Engineer: Mike Gones

(This is a revised project description: Proposal for additions and alterations to an existing one-story 2,024 square foot single-family residence located on a 13,504 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. Proposed are first floor additions of 374 square feet, a new 596 square foot second story with 346 square foot deck, replace all roofing, complete exterior remodel, and repaving the driveway, and 50 cubic yards of fill grading. The project will result in a 2,840 square foot structure which is 68% of the maximum allowable FAR. Staff Hearing Officer approval of a modification to encroach into the front yard setback is requested.)

(Second Concept Review. Story poles will be installed prior to the hearing. Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer approval of a modification.)

(Time: 5:59)

Present: Jeff Shelton, Architect; Mike Gones, Engineer, Ann and Paul S. De Bruyn Kops, Owners, and City staff person Heather Baker, AICP Project Planner.

Ms. Baker reminded the Board to keep in mind that there are different levels and gradients of significance of public views. Not all public views are protected.

Public comment opened at 6:14 p.m. The following people spoke in opposition to the project:

- 1) Carol Ostruft: addressed preservation of the neighborhood.
- 2) Bill Yule: addressed two-story construction, 2 business day notification.
- 3) Henning Jensen: addressed second story poles from Roble Lane, elevation above the street.
- 4) Cliff Hickman: designed two home across street, addressed blocked public views, architectural styling at prominent location.
- 5) Frank Hughes: addressed second story poles, appropriateness of structure size to neighborhood and architecture.
- 6) Cindy Travis: addressed blockage of private view.
- 7) Patrick Hall: addressed massing of second story toward back of lot to alleviate public concerns.
- 8) Jeff Evans: addressed second story poles, sensitive location, massing.
- 9) Nancy Caplan, for Jackie Page: addressed blockage of private views, and lack of advanced notification.
- 10) Bruce Morrow: regular walker, addressed visual impact of second story poles and massing of proposed project.
- 11) Julie Morrow: addressed second story massing and scale not fitting into scale of neighborhood.
- 12) Joyce Searls: addressed appropriate development scale, provided picture of site.
- 13) Janice Meaden: addressed horizontal sweep of private views, out-of-scale vertical building.
- 14) Derek Westin, representing several residents: addressed applicant's lack on working with neighbors, impressed with public turnout despite short notification, loud design needs to be muted, and lowering of the plate heights, easterly neighbor (Chris Kamen) concerned with privacy issues and would like the project conditioned to keep the bamboo barrier screening.
- 15) Jack Hewitt: addressed incompatibility due to large scale or development, loss of natural resources, private views, and privacy (keep bamboo hedge).
- 16) Bob Johnson: addressed short notification, fill on hillside lot which should be nestled instead, neighborhood incompatibility and out of scale structure, and blocked private views and ocean vistas.
- 17) Paul Cashman, President of Riviera Association: addressed neighborhood compatibility and opportunity for public input to preserve private views.

Public comment closed at 6:45 p.m.

The Chair explained that the Board has no authority to preserve private views.

Straw vote: Can you support a two-story element on this property? 6/0

Motion: Continued indefinitely to Full Board, with the comment to restudy the two-story element to reduce the height as much as possible.

Action: Woolery/Bernstein, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Zink absent.)

Chair Mahan announced the 10 day appeal period to City Council.

Board Comment: One Board member stated he believed the height of the structure is currently acceptable and would like to see the project move forward.

Staff Note: Modified story poles are to remain up for a future site visit. Staff will notify the Board.

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES - May 27, 2008

SFDB-CONCEPT REVIEW (CONT.)

5. 1057 ARBOLADO RD E-1 Zone
(5:55) Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-241-013
Application Number: MST2007-00462
Owner: Ann S. De Bruyn Kops
Architect: Jeff Shelton

(This is a revised project description: Proposal for one and two-story additions and alterations to an existing one-story 2,024 square foot single-family residence located on a 13,504 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. Proposed are first-floor additions of 652 square feet, a new 698 square foot second-story, and a 581 square foot second-story deck, replace all roofing, complete exterior remodel, repaving the driveway, and 50 cubic yards of fill grading. Staff Hearing Officer approvals of modifications for additions and alterations in the front yard setback and to provide part of the open yard in the front yard are requested. The proposed total of 3,220 square feet is 77% of the maximum allowable FAR.)

(Third Concept Review. Revised story poles will be installed prior to the hearing. Comments only; project requires environmental assessment and Staff Hearing Officer approval of modifications.)

(6:26)

Present: Jeff Shelton, Architect; Paul and Ann S. De Bruyn Lops, Owners.

Public comment opened at 6:35 p.m.

- 1) Cliff Hickman, opposed. Concerned about first-floor height, prefers lowering one additional foot.
- 2) Cindy Travis, opposed. Proposed deck will be too close to the neighboring property.
- 3) Lisa Reich, opposed. Concerned with scale; enforcement of good neighbor guidelines; negative precedent.
- 4) Chris Kamen, in favor. No opposition to the project.
- 5) Bob Black, opposed. Second-floor is too large and obtrusive to views; height is oppressive.
- 6) Jacqueline Page, neighbor, opposed. Views and privacy will be impacted. Patio is inconsistent with NPO Guidelines.
- 7) Patrick Hall, opposed. Project does not comply with NPO Guidelines. Massing should be moved to other side of lot.
- 8) Joyce Searls, neighbor, opposed. Relocating the mass and view deck will preserve views and privacy.
- 9) Dee Elias, opposed. Addressed quality of life concerns, privacy and tranquility.
- 10) E-mail from L. Robert Johnson addressing fill grading, privacy, loss of public views, owner's uncooperativeness.

Public comment closed at 6:59 p.m.

How many can support the modification request? 5/1

Motion: Continued indefinitely to the Staff Hearing Officer with the following comment:
The Board supports the front yard setback modification requests.

Action: Woolery/Carroll, 5/0/1. Motion carried. (Bernstein abstained. Mosel absent.)

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES- September 15, 2008

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

5. 1057 ARBOLADO RD

E-1 2

Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-241-013
Application Number: MST2007-00462
Owner: Ann S. De Bruyn Kops
Architect: Jeff Shelton

(This is a revised project description: Proposal for one and two-story additions and alterations to an existing one-story 2,024 square foot single-family residence located on a 13,504 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. Proposed are first floor additions of 652 square feet, a new 698 square foot second-story, and a 581 square foot second-story deck, replace all roofing, complete exterior remodel, repaving the driveway, and 50 cubic yards of fill grading. Staff Hearing Officer approvals of modifications for additions and alterations in the front yard setback and to provide part of the open yard in the front yard are requested. The proposed total of 3,220 square feet is 77% of the maximum allowable FAR.)

(Project requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer resolution 052-08.)

Time: 5:55

Present: Jeff Shelton, Architect; Peter De Bruyn Kops, owner's son.

Public comment opened at 6:02 p.m.

1. Bill Yule, opposed to the roof deck; roof should blend, roof decks attract potted plants.
2. Derek Westen, concerned about the party deck as entertainment space. Appreciates opening of the view corridor.
3. Cliff Hickman, opposed: concerned roof deck loses privacy for neighbors; flat tile roof is invitation for children and others. Concerned about loss of views and privacy.
4. Jack Hewett, opposed: the flat roof is 2-3 feet above the contiguous roof lines. No other home in the area has more than 2 fireplace-like protrusions. A municipal ordinance limits shrubs to 8 feet, therefore nonconforming obstruction to public views.
5. Joyce Searls, opposed: the overgrown vegetation obstructs the true mass of the project. Neighbors would like to be involved prior to Board meetings.
6. Nancy Kaplan, opposed: concerned about loss of privacy.
7. Don Graves, opposed: suggested communication with neighbors for good relations.
8. Written comments in opposition from Marge Graves were acknowledged.
9. Cindy Travis, opposed to the party deck. The fourth deck is not necessary and obstructs neighbor's views.
10. Jacqueline Page, opposed (submitted photos) concerns about interference with the public view corridor; panoramic views are not necessary for applicant; invasion of privacy; potted plants are removable; suggested eliminating the party deck and flat roof area and lowering all chimneys.

Public comment closed at 6:25 p.m.

Straw vote: How many can support the small deck over the front entry? 2/4.

Straw vote: How many can support the larger deck on south side of the ridge as designed? 5/1.

Motion: Continued two weeks to Full Board with the following comments:

- 1) The small "sunset" deck over the front entry is not supportable. Redesign the roof element between the garage and house.
- 2) The larger, south deck should not extend west beyond the kitchen wall.
- 3) Restudy the heights and number of vertical projections and chimneys in the design.
- 4) Provide a color board and color material samples, including deck tile materials.

Action: Woolery/Mosel, 6/0/0. Motion carried. (Mahan absent.)

SINGLE FAMILY DESIGN BOARD MINUTES - September 29, 2008

PRELIMINARY REVIEW

4. **1057 ARBOLADO RD E-1 Zone**
 Assessor's Parcel Number: 019-241-013
 Application Number: MST2007-00462
 Owner: Ann S. De Bruyn Kops
 Architect: Jeff Shelton

(This is a revised project description: Proposal for one and two-story additions and alterations to an existing one-story 2,024 square foot single-family residence located on a 13,504 square foot lot in the Hillside Design District. Proposed are first-floor additions of 652 square feet, a new 698 square foot second-story, and a 581 square foot second-story deck, replace all roofing, complete exterior remodel, repaving the driveway, and 50 cubic yards of fill grading. Staff Hearing Officer approvals of Modifications for additions and alterations in the front yard setback and to provide part of the open yard in the front yard are requested. The proposed total of 3,220 square feet is 77% of the maximum allowable FAR.)

(Fifth Concept Review. Project requires compliance with Staff Hearing Officer Resolution No. 052-08.)

Time: 5:29

Present: Jeff Shelton, Architect; Paul and Ann De Bruyn Kops, Owners.

Public comment opened at 5:40 p.m.

1. Bill Yule, opposed to roof decks on the Riviera.
2. Jack Hewett: opposed to the use of decks; size of party deck; 48 inch parapet doesn't make sense, future owner might install irrigation lines; suggested installation of rounded skylight.
3. Derek Westen: opposed, acknowledged progress made to date; suggested having a narrower outdoor deck and stepping the ridge; concerned that the "boxy" parapet element will obstruct neighbor's ocean views.
4. Joyce Searls: the project has improved, but the parapet area is jarring.
5. A letter in opposition from Paula Westbury was acknowledged.

Public comment closed at 5:54 p.m.

Motion: Preliminary Approval of the project as a basis for working drawings with the finding that the Neighborhood Preservation Ordinance criteria have been met as stated in Subsection 22.69.050 of the City of Santa Barbara Municipal Code return to Full Board for in-progress review with the following conditions:

- 1) Study the skylight detail.
- 2) Study the parapet roof above the entry to be less deep.
- 3) Provide tile, colors, and details.
- 4) Project provides consistency of appearance, compatible with neighborhood, quality of architecture and materials.

Action: Woolery/Deisler, 4/1/0. Motion carried. (Bernstein opposed. Carroll absent.)

The ten-day appeal period was announced.